EXPLORING AN ART CONTROVERSY

High School

World History/International Relations
Art History
Language Arts: Research, Critical Thinking, Developing an Argument,
Writing, Defending an Argument

Dear Teacher:

In putting together this lesson plan for high school students, the Parthenon Education staff envisioned a multi-disciplinary approach that demonstrates to students the many ways of approaching an issue or problem. We focus on two topical issues: the repatriation of the Elgin Marbles as part of the restoration of the Acropolis in Athens, Greece and the broader international issue involving the legitimate claims of "ownership" of cultural property. In addressing these issues, we draw upon the disciplines of art, architecture, history, international relations, literature, and science. While students may approach the issues from the perspective that appeals to them, they should come away with an awareness and appreciation of other ways to address the same problem. Will the scientist, artist, politician, and historian see the same issues differently? Are there areas of agreement creating the possibility of fruitful negotiations? What contributions to solutions could be made through technology?

At first glance, this approach may seem difficult for students, but the steps involve the development and use of skill sets that will be needed throughout life: researching known facts through available documents, critical analysis of opinions and arguments of others, weighing evidence in determining the appropriate course of action, supporting one's position, and negotiating a settlement.

The process will challenge high school students, but we believe they will gain valuable insight and confidence with the completion of this task. Materials may be adjusted to a level you believe is suitable for your students.

Because our approach and the challenge to students is new to our web site, we believe that it is important that participating teachers take time to fill out and email the teacher feedback page listed on the web site's Educational Resources page. Thank you for your interest in the Parthenon. We hope this intense exercise will be interesting and valuable to you and your students.

DeeGee Lester, Education Director

Introduction

The controversy surrounding the Elgin Marbles - whether they should remain in London or be repatriated to Athens - has raged for over two hundred years. After reviewing the materials in this portion of the packet, you may explore the question of repatriation of art and objects from several directions, including those listed below.

- 1. Using the enclosed information sheets and any additional research materials listed in the "Additional Resources," at the end of this lesson plan web site, weigh the evidence and argue *for* or *against* the return of the Elgin Marbles to Greece.
- 2. Imagine you are a representative on an international committee that must negotiate an "agreement" concerning the Elgin Marbles that will be acceptable to all parties. In devising your agreement, keep in mind the following: *historical* considerations (What is *cultural heritage*? Do some objects override heritage of a specific culture to become

financial considerations (Should the Greeks "purchase" their own national treasures? Should the British be compensated for their loss?); environmental considerations (How much regard should be given to issues such as pollution levels in London and Athens or climate controls in the museums?); considerations for international precedents (Is the agreement applicable to all such cases or to the Elgin case only? Once the international community crosses the line regarding repatriation of specific artifacts, can the line be redrawn to protect other collections? What effect would the repatriation of all artifacts to their countries of origin have for the world's museums?).

- **3.** What problems and opportunities do you foresee if laser copying of artifacts and other high tech solutions are perfected and put into practice?
- **4.** Expand the issue of repatriation beyond the Elgin Marbles and explore the issue from other perspectives such as the special problems encountered by the Holocaust Museum in Washington, D.C. (see Michael Kernan, "A national memorial bears witness to the tragedy of the Holocaust," *Smithsonian Magazine*, , 51-62), the repatriation of artifacts taken in World War II, or the efforts by the African Repatriation Movement to locate and restore their national treasures.

THE ELGIN MARBLES

The collection known as the *Elgin Marbles* is named after a Scotsman, Thomas Bruce (Lord Elgin), and the sculptures (or "marbles") from the Acropolis in Athens, Greece. The controversy surrounding the Elgin Marbles centers on the removal and transporting to London of those Greek national treasures by Lord Elgin and his representatives between 1800 and 1806.

Prodded by his personal architect and encouraged by his own advancement to the post of British Ambassador to Constantinople in 1799, Lord Elgin saw an opportunity to establish himself as the arbiter of taste in London by becoming *the* authority on Greek antiquities. From his office in Constantinople, Elgin put together a team of architects and artists led by his trusted secretary, William Richard Hamilton, and the Neopolitan painter, Giovanni Lusieri. Initial instructions for the team were limited to the measuring and sketching of Greek monuments. Even those efforts were frustrated by restrictions placed upon the team by the Turks who controlled Greece and the buildings on the Acropolis.

A more ambitious goal emerged in 1801 when the Chaplain to the British Embassy in Constantinople, Dr. Philip Hunt, visited the work site in Athens and urged Elgin to use his influence as ambassador to obtain a "firman" (document of clearance)) from the Turks, allowing greater freedom for the team. Written in Italian by Turks for the English, the firman included the word "qualche" when referring to the removal of sculptures from the monuments. The word can be translated as "some" or as "any," and Hunt applied the broadest possible interpretation to the directive to "take away <u>any</u> sculptures or inscriptions which do not interfere with the works or walls of the citadel."

Fearing the possibility that the Greek treasures could fall into the hands of Napoleon's French forces, Elgin urged a speedy removal of the marbles. The speed of removal of the marbles and concerns about weight and size during the transporting phase, resulted in breakage and acts of mutilation, including the sawing in half of many sculptures for packing. Again, Elgin used his diplomatic influence to transport the marbles on British warships. But his triumph was already marred by a run of bad luck including a ship wreck (the lost cases were recovered two years later), mounting controversy about the removal of the marbles, and his own capture and imprisonment by the French (1802-1806) during a return trip to England and following his one brief visit to the Acropolis.

Following his release, Elgin returned to London to face abandonment by his wife, a sea of debts, and accusations that he had "raped" some of the world's treasures. Lord Elgin stored the treasures in a huge, damp shed on the grounds of his London home. His efforts to sell the collection to the British government was an attempt both to provide climate conditions for the collection and to recoup his expenses (estimated in British currency at £74,240). Meanwhile, the marbles gained notoriety as admirers visited periodic exhibits and critics (from the poet Lord Byron to members of Parliament) denounced Lord Elgin as a "looter" and insisted upon the return of the collection to Greece - a demand that increased after Greece gained independence from the Turks in 1833.

In 1816, the House of Commons (voting 83-30) offered Elgin £35,000 which he reluctantly accepted, and the sculptures were moved to the British Museum. A permanent exhibition area, The Elgin Room, was established in 1831 and continue to house the marbles until the mid-20th century. By 1928 congestion in the Elgin Room and controversy about visitor confusion resulting from a mix of original marbles and plaster casts, led Sir Joseph (later Lord) Duveen to finance the building of a new gallery to house

the Elgin collection. Construction of the new gallery was halted during World War II, and the completed Duveen Gallery was not opened until 1962.

Was it Lord or Lady Elgin?

Susan Nagel's book, Mistress of the Elgin Marbles: A Biography of Mary Nisbet, Countess of Elgin inserts an exciting twist to the Elgin Marble legend with historical evidence demonstrating the powerful role of Lady Elgin's fortune and family connections in assuring the passage to England of the classical sculptures.

Sources: Epam A. Vranopoulos. <u>The Parthenon & The Elgin Marbles</u> (Athens: 1985): 7-9.; Russell Chamberlin, <u>Loot! The Heritage of Plunder</u> (New York: 1983): 13-38; and B.F. Cook, <u>The Elgin Marbles</u> (London: British Museum Press, 1984); Christopher Hitchens, <u>The Elgin Marbles: Should they be returned to Greece?</u> (London/New York: Verso, 1997 edition). Susan Nagel. <u>Mistress of the Elgin Marble: A Biography of Mary Nisbet, Countess of Elgin</u> (New York: William Morrow, 2004).

CONTROVERSY: THE RETURN OF THE ELGIN MARBLES

For over two hundred years, one of the greatest controversies within the art world has revolved around whether the famous Elgin Marbles (sculptures removed from the Acropolis, 1800-1806, by Lord Elgin's representatives and housed in the British Museum) should be returned to Greece. From the beginning of Elgin's Greek adventures, the British gentry, accustomed to picking up treasures in their jaunts around the world, split over whether, in this case, one of *their own* crossed the line from collector to looter. Many upper class Englishmen sought to distance their nation from the controversy by pointing out that Elgin was "a Scotsman."

Writers and poets from Lord Byron ("Childe Harold's Pilgrimage" and "The Curse of Minerva") to the Irish revolutionary, Sir Roger Casement, and editorial writers such as Franklin Harrison, lamented Elgin's removal of the marbles and demanded their return to Greece. The sentiments were echoed on the floors of Parliament as that august body recognized Greek independence from the Turks, debated the initial purchase of the sculptures for the British Museum, or periodically sought to "reward" Greek support and sacrifice in British war efforts (for example, in World War II) with

return of their own national treasures. However, today the marbles remain securely in British possession, still housed in the Elgin Room and supported by successive British governments and by international recommendations such as that of the Cultural Committee of the Council of Europe that Britain retain the marbles.

THE BRITISH ARGUMENT:

Britain's claim of legitimacy in retaining possession of the Elgin Marbles is based on five arguments. 1) That the purchase of the marbles was secured from the Turks (the nation in control of Greece at the time) through legal process. 2) The failure of the Greek people to demonstrate efforts to save their own national treasures. 3) The removal of the marbles *rescued* these treasures from the destruction from war or further neglect. 4) The marbles were *destined* for removal from Greece during the period by either British or French forces under Napoleon; 5) More recently, British supporters argue that the sculptures would suffer further damage if removed from the controlled, safe environment of the British Museum and returned to the atmospheric pollution of Athens where "nearly 90 percent of all Greek industry lies within ten miles of the Acropolis."

THE GREEK ARGUMENT:

The Greek demand for the return of the marbles is based on five rebuttals to British claims. 1) The British claim of legal purchase is invalid because permission was granted by representatives of a conquering nation rather than by the Greeks (the legitimate owners of their national treasures). 2) That so-called *legal* procedures in removing the marbles amounted to little more than "bribery" of Turkish officials, rather than a legitimate "purchase." 3) The claim that Elgin's motivation was an effort to "save" the marbles is contradicted by the irreparable damage suffered by the monuments (including structural damage to the Parthenon and the Erechtheum) and the breakage and mutilation of many sculptures during removal and shipping. 4) Claims of Greek *silence* during removal of their national treasures are more likely attributable to subjugation by the Turks than to Greek indifference. Stories throughout Greece during the period of removal of the marbles tell of mournful cries and wails emanating from the monuments or from within the crates of marbles as they were being transported. Less dramatic, but equally indicative of the sadness and sense of urgency with which Greeks witnessed the removal of their marbles, was the formation of societies throughout the country for the protection of antiquities and the efforts of the Patriarch and the clergy to protect antiquities. 5) The Greeks counter British concerns about pollution in Athens by pointing out that the warm, dry climate of the city is preferable to London's cold, damp climate - a major concern of Lord Elgin himself. The Greeks also remind critics that the safety and control of a museum setting is as possible in Athens as in London, and that the aesthetic value of the marbles will increase when these national and world treasures are returned to their "historical and aesthetic settings."

Sources: Epam A. Vranopoulos. <u>The Parthenon & The Elgin Marbles</u> (Athens, 1985); Roland & Francoise Etienne. <u>The Search For Ancient Greece</u> (London: 1992): 63-83, and 130-163; and Russell Chamberlin. <u>Loot!</u> The Heritage of Plunder New York: 1983): 13-38.

The Romantic Poets:

Romanticism, weaving passion with idealization of the Classical period, emerged as an artistic and intellectual movement in the late 18th century, and continued into the mid-19th century. Corresponding with the Enlightenment, which focused on nature and *Reason*, Romanticism in literature, art, and architecture upheld ancient Greece and Rome as the epitome of taste.

Along with the rest of western civilization the Romantics, including Percy Bysshe Shelly, John Keats, Samuel Taylor Coleridge, William Wordsworth, and especially Lord Byron (George Gordon) rediscovered ancient Greece and Rome. The rediscovery paralleled political developments of the period, including the decline of the Ottoman Empire, the excitement resulting from archaeological expeditions into the region, the closing of Europe as a result of the Napoleonic Wars (forcing tourists to find alternate destinations for their Grand Tours), the efforts in America and France to establish democracies modeled after ancient Greece, the scramble for antiquities by private collectors and museums, and finally, the Greek war of liberation from the Turks which resulted in Greek independence.

The Romantics utilized Classical themes and references, and liberally sprinkled their poems and other writings with mythological characters and ancient terms and places. Education's

focus on the classics in history, mythology, and Greek and Latin languages (especially among the upper classes) meant that these references and themes would be immediately grasped by readers.

Most famous of the Romantics, Lord Byron alternated between international acclaim for his genius, his melancholy, and his glamorous presence, and public scorn for his reckless, dramatic, and often, scandalous life. Byron was educated at Harrow and Cambridge and burst onto London's literary scene. World travels punctuated by ship wrecks, a dangerous bout with the fever, the gallant rescue of a maiden, a brief stay with a Pasha, and rambles through ancient lands enriched his poetry and contributed to his dashing public image. His association with Greece was already firmly established when he returned on the same vessel which carried the final shipment of the Elgin Marbles.

At home in England, Byron was both embraced by adoring fans (especially women) and mocked and denounced by detractors following the scandalous (and never explained) abandonment of the poet by his wife and child, as well as his thinly-veiled attack upon the Prince Regent in the poem, "A Lady Weeps." Byron went into self-imposed exile in Europe, producing many of his most famous pieces, including the latter cantos of "Childe Harold," and "Don Juan".

The final phase of Byron's life was an expedition to Greece at the height of the Greek war of independence. Accepting an assignment to Missolonghi from the Greek Committee (a London group with pro-Greek sympathies), Byron sailed on Friday the 13th in July, 1824. The sea voyage was racked by storms, and several vessels in the group wrecked in the narrow channel. The Missolonghi venture was a disaster plagued by quarrels, mutiny, murder, and incessant rain. Byron, again gripped with fever, struggled to stay alive and reach the shores of Greece until April 19, 1824 when, in the midst of the huge thunderstorm, he died. Greece requested, but was denied possession of the body. Byron's return to England unleashed powerful emotion among admirers, especially among the young. A distraught Tennyson (age 15) carved into a rock, "Byron is dead!" Jane Welsh, a friend of Thomas Carlyle, wrote to him from Greece after learning the news, beginning again with the words "Byron is dead!" and then pouring forth her grief, horrified that she had been told in a room full of people, and comparing his death to the disappearance of the sum and the moon.



CHILDE HAROLD'S PILGRIMAGE Lord Byron

CANTO THE SECOND: I-II

Come, blue-eyed maid of heaven! But thou alas,
Didst never yet one mortal song inspireGoddess of Wisdom! Here thy temple was,
And is, despite of war and wasting fire,
And years, that bade thy worship to expire:
But worse than steel, and flame, and ages slow,
Is the dread sceptre and dominion dire
Of men who never felt the sacred glow
That thoughts of thee and thine on polish'd breasts bestow.

Ancient of days! August Athena! where,
Where are thy men of might? Thy grand in soul?
Gone - glimmering through the dream of things that were:
First in the race that led to Glory's goal,
They won, and pass'd away - is this the whole?
A schoolboy's tale, the wonder of an hour!
The warrior's weapon and the sophist's stole
Are sought in vain, and o'er each mouldering tower,
Dim with the mist of years, gray flits the shade of power.

CANTO THE SECOND: XIII

What! Shall it e'er be said by British tongue,
Albion was happy in Athena's tears?
Though in thy name the slaves her bosom wrung,
Tell not the deed to blushing Europe's ears:
The ocean queen, the free Britannia, bears
The last poor plunder from a bleeding land:
Yes, she, whose gen'rous aid her name endears,
Tore down those remnants with a harpy's hand,
Which envious Eld forebode, and tyrants left to stand.

CANTO THE SECOND: XV

Cold is the heart, fair Greece, that looks on thee, Nor feels as lovers o'er the dust they loved; Dull is the eye that will not weep to see Thy walls defaced, they mouldering shrines removed
By British hands, which it had best behoved
To guard those relics ne'er to b restored.
Curst be the hour when from their isle they roved,
And once again they hapless bosom gored,
And snatch'd thy shrinking Gods to northern climes abhorr'd!

Outraged by the removal of the Parthenon sculptures from their home on the Acropolis, Byron continued to unleashed his wrath upon Lord Elgin – poetically, of course.

The Curse of Minerva

(Lines 89-128):

'Mortal!' - 'twas thus she spake - 'that blush of shame
Proclaims thee Briton, once a noble name;
First of the mighty, foremost of the free,
Now honour'd *less* by all, and *least* by me:
Chief of thy foes shall Pallas still be found.
Seek'st thou the cause of loathing? - look around.

Lo! Here despite of war and wasting fire,
I saw successive tyrannies expire;
'Scaped from the ravage of the Turk and Goth,
Thy country sends a spoiler worse than both.
Survey this vacant, violated fane;
Recount the relics torn that yet remain:
These Cecrops placed, this Pericles adorn'd.
That Adrian rear'd when drooping Science
mourn'd.

What more I owe let gratitude attest Know, Alaric and Elgin did the rest.

That all may learn from whence the plunderer
came,

That insulted wall sustains his hated name: For Elgin's fame thus grateful Pallas pleads, Below his name - above behold his deeds! Be ever hail'd with equal honour here The Gothic monarch and the Pietish peer: Arms gave the first his right, the last had none,

But basely stole what less barbarians won.
So when the lion quits his fell repast,
Next prowls the wolf, the filthy jackal last:
Flesh, limbs, and blood the former make
their own.

The last poor brute securely gnaws the bone.
Yet still the gods are just, and crimes are cross'd:
See here what Elgin won, and what he lost!
Another name with his pollutes my shrine:
Behold where Dian's beams disdain to shine!
Some retribution still might Pallas claim,
When Venus half avenged Minerva's shame.
She ceas'd awhile, and thus I dared reply.
To soothe the vengeance kindling in her eye:
'Daughter of Jove! In Britain's injured name,
A true-born Briton may the deed disclaim.
Frown not on England; Englands owns him not:
Athena, no! thy plunderer was a Scot.

Lines 163-206:

'First on the head of him who did this deed My curse shall light, - on him and all his seed: Without one spark of intellectual fire, Be all the sons as senseless as the sire: If one with wit the parent brood disgrace, Believe him bastard of a brighter race. Still with his hireling artists let him prate, And Folly's praise repay for Wisdom's hate; Long of their patron's gusto let them tell, Whose noblest, *native* gusto is - to sell: To sell, and make - may Shame record the day!-The state receiver of his pilfer'd prey. Meantime, the flattering, feeble dotard, West, Europe's worst dauber, and poor Britain's best, With palsied hand shall turn each model o'er And own himself an infant of fourscore. Be all the bruisers cull'd from all St. Giles' That art and nature may compare their styles; While brawny brutes in stupid wonder stare, And marvel at his lordship's "stone shop" there. Round the throng'd gate shall sauntering coxcombs creep, To lounge and lucubrate, to prate and peep;

While many a languid maid, with longing sigh, On giant statues casts the curious eye; The room with transient glance appears to skim, Yet marks the mighty back and length of limb; Mourns o'er the difference of *now* and *then*; Exclaims, "These Greeks indeed were proper men!" Draws sly comparisons of these and those, And envies Lais all her Attic beaux. When shall a modern maid have swains like these! Alas, Sir Harry is no Hercules! And last of all, amidst the gaping crew, Some calm spectator, as he takes his view, In silent indignation mix'd with grief, Admires the plunder but abhors the thief. Oh, loathed in life not pardon'd in the dust, May hate pursue his sacrilegious lust! Link'd with the fool that fired the Ephesian dome, Shall vengeance follow far beyond the tomb, And Eratostratus and Elgin shine In many a branding page and burning line; Alike reserved for aye to stand accursed, Perchance the second blacker than the first.

POETRY NOTES: Byron's "The Curse of Minerva"

For this educational packet only two portions of Lord Byron's long poem, "The Curse of Minerva," were selected. Below are the definitions and explanations of words and phrases which appear in the poem and may be unfamiliar.

Minerva - Roman goddess of wisdom, the arts, and martial prowess, she is the Roman version of the Greek goddess, Athena.

Pallas - reference to Pallas Athena.

Alaric - Visigoth king who conquered Rome.

Gothic monarch - reference to Alaric.

Pietish peer - reference to Elgin.

West - reference to artist Benjamin West.

lucubrate - laborious study and scholarly writing.

Attic - pertaining to Attica, Athens, or Athenians.

"fool that fired the Ephesian dome" - reference to Erastostratus (see below).

Erastostratus - responsible for the burning of the Temple of Diana at Ephesus (ironically on the same day as the birth of Alexander the Great) simply to assure that his name would be remembered).

Other Poets Chime In:

John Keats:

On Seeing The Elgin Marbles

My spirit is too weak - mortality
Weighs heavily on me like unwilling sleep,
And each imagin'd pinnacle and steep
Of godlike hardship, tells me I must die
Like a sick Eagle looking at the sky.
Yet 'tis a gentle luxury to weep
That I have not the cloudy winds to keep,
Fresh for the opening of the morning's eye.
Such dim-conceived glories of the brain
Bring round the heart an undescribable feud;
So do these wonders a most dizzy pain,
That mingles Grecian grandeur with the rude
Wasting of old Time - with a billowy main A sun - a shadow of a magnitude.

HERMAN MELVILLE'S "PARTHENON"

In the winter of 1856, during a period of personal despair, American poet Herman Melville visited Athens and recorded in his personal journal a series of bleak impressions of the Parthenon:

February 8th Sunday...Acropolis - blocks of marble like...huge cakes of wax. - Parthenon elevated like cross of Constantine. Strange contrast of rugged rock with polished temple...Imperceptible seams - frozen together- Break like cakes of snow....

February 10th Tuesday...Among the ruins- revisited them all...Pavement of Parthenon - square - blocks of ice. (frozen together.) - No matter: -Delicacy of frost-work....

February 11the Wednesday. Clear & beautiful day. Fine ride on box to Pireus. Acropolis in sight nearly whole way. Straight road...Pentelicus covered at top with snow - looking down on its child, the Parthenon. - Ruins of Parthenon like North River breaking up.

Contrast this description in the poem, "The Parthenon," which Melville penned four years later;

Seen aloft from afar.
Estranged in site,
Aerial gleaming, warmly white,
You look a suncloud motionless
In noon of day divine;
Your beauty charmed enhancement takes
In Art's long after-shine.

Nearer viewed.

Like Lais, fairest of her kind,
In subtlety your form's defined The cornice curved, each shaft inclined,
While yet, to eyes that do but revel
And take the sweeping view,
Erect this seems, and that a level,
To line and plummet true.

The Frieze.

What happy musings genial went
With airiest touch the chisel lent
To frisk and curvet light
Of horses gay - their riders graveContrasting so in action brave
With virgins meekly bright,
Clear filing on in even tone

With pitcher each, one after one Like water-fowl in flight.

The Last Tile

When the last marble tile was laid
The winds died down on all the seas;
Hushed were the birds, and swooned the glade;
Ictinus sat, Aspasia said
"Hist! - Art's meridian, Pericles!"

Source: Peter Green, "The Parthenon in Literature," <u>The Parthenon</u> (New York: Newsweek Books Division, 1978), 150-51

POETIC PROTEST:

Poetic protests regarding continued possession of the Elgin Marbles by the British Museum extended beyond the 19th century England. For example, look at the poem below penned by an early 20th century Irish revolutionary, Sir Roger Casement.* Notice his idyllic description of pre-industrial Athens.

Give back the Elgin marbles, let them lie
Unsullied, pure beneath an attic sky.
The smoky fingers of our northern clime
More ruin work than all ancient time.
How oft' the roar of the Pirean Sea
Through colmn'd hall and dusky temple stealing
Hath struck these marble ears, that now must flee
The whirling hum of London, noonward reeling.
Ah! Let them hear again the sound that float
Around Athene's shrine on morning breeze The lowing ox, the bell of climbing goat
And drowsy drone of far Hymettus' breeze.
Give back the marbles; let them vigil keep
Where art still lives, over Pheidias' tomb, asleep.

• Between 1914 and 1916, Sir Roger Casement emerged as a central figure in Ireland's efforts to obtain Home Rule from Britain. Prior to embracing Irish Home Rule, Casement, a Protestant from Antrim (now in Northern Ireland), received a knighthood from the British government for his service as a Consular official. In preparation for a 1914 planned uprising, Casement and a British civil servant, Erskine Childers, procured arms from Germany and shipped them aboard Childers' yacht to Howth, near Dublin, for distribution among the Irish Volunteers and the Irish Citizen Army. The sudden outbreak of World War I aborted that uprising. Two years later, on the eve of a planned Easter Rising, Casement, aboard a German submarine, escorted a German ship in an attempted landing of 20,000 rifles and ammunition on the western coast of Ireland. Casement was immediately arrested and later executed for treason. Despite the setback, the Easter Rising went forward and fighting in Dublin lasted five days before British forces regained control of the city and executed leaders of the uprising.

Students:

Now it's your turn. Review the information above and explore the resources listed below. Then develop and defend your argument for or against the return of the Elgin Marbles.

Other questions that may be address and debated include: Do you see parallels between the question of the Elgin Marbles and efforts to return looted art from WWII?

Do you see the Elgin Marbles as "looted" or "saved" by the British? Are there parallels between the Elgin Marbles and efforts by ARM to repatriate objects on behalf of the nations in Africa? What do these efforts for repatriation mean to the world's great museums?

Additional Resources

- http://prometheus.cc.emory.edu/panels/5E/g.Wood.html
 - "Prometheus unplugged? The Strange Case of Lord Elgin's Nose" Gillen Wood
- <u>http://www.guardian.co.uk/Archive/Article/0,4273,4208365,00html</u>
 - Friday, June 22, 2001, The Guardian, "Greek Weapon in Fight For Marbles."
- http://www.guardian.co.uk/Archive/Article/0,4273,4208365.00.html May 9, 1999, The Gaurdian, "Museums 'Ruined Marbles'."
- http://www.elginism.com/definition/
 - "What is Elginism?"
- http://education.guardian.co.uk/eweely/story/0,5500,519048,00,html
 July 10, 2001, The Guardian, "Who should have the Elgin Marbles?" by Jerome Monohan
- http://www.espianageinfo.com/AN-Ba/Archeaology-and-Artifacts-Protection-of-During-War.html
 "Archaeology and Artifacts, Protections of During War." By Adriennne Wilmoth Lerner
- http://www.lootedart.com/news/archives/January-march2003.asp
 - "The Central Registry of Information on Looted Cultural Property 1933-1945."
- http://www.arm.ard.co.uk/
 - African Repatriation Movement
- http://www.sfgate.com/cgi=bin/article/cgi
 - March 9, 2003, <u>San Francisco Chronicle</u>, "More Voices Demanding Repatriation of Looted Art." By Kenneth Baker
- http://www.museum.security.org/ww2/
 - "WWII and the Looted Art Problem."
- http://fcit.coedu.usf.edu/holocaust/arts/arts/htm.
 - "A Teachers Guide to The Holocaust: The Arts."
- http://fcit.coedu.usf.edu/holocaust/resources/biblio/ARTBIBLT.htm
 "Bibliography: Looted Art."

There are a number of web sites exploring the recent international dispute in which Italy demanded the return of 40 antiquities from the Getty Museum in California. Some interesting sites include:

- http://www.latimes.com/news/local/la-me-getty31jul31,1,3042239.story "Getty, Italy reopen talks on antiquities."
- http://www.artsjournal.com/man/2007/07/marion true lives within her m.html
 "Marion true lives within her means"
- http://www.boston.com/news/world/europe/articles/2007/08/02/italy looted art
- "Italy: Looted art values increase"
- http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/08/01/AR2007080102355.html "Getty to Return 40 Artifacts to Italy"
- http://news.yahoo.com/s/afp/20070802/ennew_afp/entertainmentusitaly_070802143441 "Italy's Accord with Getty helped 'tighten noose' on art traffickers."

BOOKS:

- Atwood, Roger, Stealing History: Tomb Raiders, Smugglers & the Looting of the Ancient World (New York: St. Martin's Press, 2004).
- Renfre, Colin. *Loot, Legitmacy & Ownership: The Ethical Crisis in Archaeology* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co., Ltd., 2000).
- Watson, Peter and Todeschini, Cecelia. *The Medici Conspiracy: The Illicit Journey of Looted Antiquities From Italy's Tomb Raiders to the World's Great Museums*. (New York: Public Affairs/ Perseus Books Group, 2006).